



Evaluation and Quality of Literature Textbooks in Upper Secondary Education in Kosovo

Research article

Safete Statovci-Shala

Researcher for textbooks and teaching aids Kosovo Pedagogical Institute

Received: 2025/09/09

Accepted: 2025/12/14

Abstract

The main objective of this study is to analyze the importance, content, and educational function of literature textbooks in upper secondary education in Kosovo, evaluating how well they align with contemporary curriculum requirements and the development of students' competencies. The study aims to identify existing shortcomings in the selection of authors, literary periods, and presentation methods, as well as to propose recommendations for improving the quality, inclusiveness, and impact of literary texts on students' cultural formation. Through a combined methodological approach, the study applies theoretical, descriptive, comparative, inductive, deductive, and statistical analyses to achieve the defined objectives. The population includes teachers and students from seven regions of Kosovo, while the sample consists of 200 students and 30 randomly selected teachers. Data were collected through questionnaires for students and teachers. The results contribute to improving the quality of textbooks, ensuring fair evaluation of literature textbooks, increasing the representation of Albanian authors, and enriching literary content in line with contemporary educational requirements.

Keywords: *Textbooks, evaluation, quality, inspiration, literary text*

Since textbooks, especially literary ones as forms of linguistic and poetic expression, must be accessible and understandable to every reader, they always

constitute an object of critical evaluation and require a high standard of quality both in content and in structure. According to the strategic document of the Ministry of

Education, Science and Technology (Ministry of Education, Science and Technology [MEST], 2016), strategic priority 5: Teaching and Learning – 5.2. Textbooks and other teaching materials are developed for all grades and subjects, the role of textbooks as a fundamental element of the educational process and their impact on improving the quality of learning is clearly emphasized.

In this context, textbooks serve not only as didactic tools for the transmission of knowledge but also as instruments for the aesthetic and cultural formation of students. In this study, the focus lies on the origin, tradition, and development of literary texts used for educational purposes, following their evolution from the early periods to the present day. This approach aims to highlight the impact that these texts have on the intellectual, ethical, and emotional formation of students, as well as on the acquisition of essential knowledge for the development of literary and cultural competencies. Thus, they constitute an irreplaceable link in the country's educational system and in the process of building the cultural capital of younger generations. Discussions about the role of literary texts in comparison to linguistic (grammatical) texts continue to this day, often reflecting differing opinions about the weight each should have in the teaching process. For some scholars, literary texts have a broader formative function, as they develop imagination, aesthetic sensibility, and the ability to interpret the world, while linguistic texts mainly serve to build linguistic competence. However, the importance of literary texts as sources of linguistic, cultural, and aesthetic knowledge remains indisputable, as they help broaden students' intellectual horizons and prepare them for critical thinking and in-depth interpretation of reality.

The literary text has multiple functions: it fosters interest in literature, develops the ability to work independently, strengthens critical thinking, and helps in building aesthetic judgment. For this reason, contemporary textbooks are constructed according to modern methodological standards, including creative and interactive content that makes the learning process more engaging, meaningful, and closer to students' everyday experiences. In this way, the text becomes a bridge between literary theory and the practice of critical reading. Literature is

an integral part of the curriculum at all school levels from primary to secondary education, with content adapted to age, intellectual development, and the competencies required by the modern curriculum. The quality of a literary text depends not only on its content but also on its aesthetic and technical components, which require deep knowledge in the fields of literature, pedagogy, and textbook design so that the content is of the highest quality. This implies that the creation of a textbook should be the result of collaborative work among literary authors, pedagogical editors, and education experts.

In addition to its literary and cultural values, the text should contribute to the development of aesthetic sense, mental abilities, linguistic ethics, and the culture of communication. With the reform of educational policies and scientific advancements, it becomes necessary to adapt textbook design methods to the demands of modern times in order to ensure more inclusive, contemporary, and innovative content. An important aspect that is often neglected, but directly affects the acquisition of knowledge, is the visual presentation and the technical aspect of the text, such as typography, font size, the structure of titles, and illustrations. These aesthetic elements, in addition to their artistic function, help facilitate reading and increase students' motivation for more active engagement in the learning process. In this way, the textbook does not remain merely a teaching instrument but becomes a complete cultural and didactic experience that assists in shaping the student's personality and developing them as active and creative readers.

Literature Review

The new Albanian school faces profound responsibilities—no longer limited to teaching writing and reading, but to acquiring deeper knowledge of Albanian literature, its origins, directions, and contemporary perspectives. The history of school textbooks in the Albanian language is closely linked to the historical, social, political, and educational developments of the Albanian people. With the growth of literary production, new works were created and adapted for educational purposes, becoming an important part of the cultural and aesthetic formation of younger generations. According to the General

Standards for School Textbooks (Ministry of Education, Science and Technology [MEST], 2011), a quality textbook must meet several basic criteria: alignment with the curriculum, visual clarity, high-quality illustrations, scientific accuracy, age-appropriate content, and didactic structuring that includes questions, tasks, and practical exercises. Furthermore, textbooks must reflect gender equality, social and historical realities, and include cross-curricular content as well as teachers' guides. In this context, literature textbooks in Kosovo have shown significant progress in complying with these standards. The content of the textbooks demonstrates a consistent effort to include the entire corpus of national literature—from early writings to contemporary works (Qosja, 2008). The new curriculum of Albanian literature defines the teaching content and allocation of class hours for each module in accordance with the Law on the Publication of School Textbooks and Teaching Materials (Assembly of the Republic of Kosovo, 2007).

Formal and content-related changes in textbooks are essential to adapt to international trends and to foster students' independent and creative thinking. Regarding the quality of presentation and design, Albanian language and literature textbooks show a consistent and well-structured format, accompanied by aesthetically pleasing illustrations carefully adapted to the selected texts and their intended messages (KosEd, 2023). Textbooks should no longer be limited to the transmission of information but should promote students' analytical, reflective, and creative skills. Contemporary textbooks must provide diverse modes of learning, encourage learner autonomy, and develop problem-solving abilities (Dado, 2000). The most effective method for studying modern literature is the one that focuses on the distinctive aspects of literary art and on the ways of interpreting its meaning (Dado, 2000). This approach requires that the evaluation of textbooks include both internal review by authors and external evaluation by experts to ensure scientific quality and clarity of content (Ministry of Education, Science and Technology [MEST], 2011). The development of textbooks in the Albanian language has been closely connected with the country's social and national developments. A successful class session cannot be achieved without a high-quality literary text and a

proper interpretation of the teaching unit. The importance of the teacher's professional authority remains the key to success in the teaching process, while the assessment of students' progress is essential for identifying learning gaps and improving pedagogical practice.

At a broader level, a textbook is defined as a learning resource that covers a specific subject and serves as a primary tool in the educational process for acquiring knowledge and developing students' skills (Huang, 2024). Over the past decades, significant progress has been observed in the study of textbooks and teaching materials at the international level, approached from multiple research and pedagogical perspectives (Rodríguez et al., 2022). Moreover, textbooks, particularly in fields such as mathematics, should include real-life problems that require higher-order cognitive skills, enabling students to apply knowledge in complex and practical contexts (Otieno & Povey, 2023; Sugiarni et al., 2024).

The process of decentralization led to a rapid development of local textbooks, accompanied by increasingly broad international collaboration. During the same period, in 1986, a national commission for textbook censorship was established to ensure their quality and appropriateness (Pan & Zhu, 2022). Despite these efforts, several limitations have been identified that textbook authors face globally; however, studies that specifically examine the process of textbook production and not other dimensions of teaching materials remain relatively scarce in the existing literature (Yıldız & Harwood, 2024). Through the analysis of officially approved literary school textbooks, researchers demonstrate how Kazakhstan constructs a dominant understanding of what it means to be Kazak emphasizing unity, resilience, and pride in national heritage. Key historical events such as the wars with the Dzhungars, the annexation by the Russian Empire, and the Soviet period are presented as decisive moments in shaping national identity and collective memory (Burkhanov & Sharipova, 2024). Similarly, Mulyani et al. (2023) explain that German textbooks encompass various aspects of German culture; however, teachers in Indonesia often overlook their significance in teaching (Mulyani & Basrowi, 2024). This highlights how cultural content within textbooks can

be undervalued or inconsistently applied across different educational contexts. In this regard, Lazar (1996), in his seminal book “Literature and Language Teaching”, identifies three main approaches to the use of literature in second language (L2) teaching: the language-based approach, the approach that treats literature as content, and the approach aimed at the learner’s personal enrichment. These three perspectives offer complementary ways to integrate literary texts into the language learning process, emphasizing the development of linguistic competence, cultural knowledge, and learners’ individual experiences (Lazar, 1996; Sun, 2023). Furthermore, writing assessment requires teachers or assessors to consider multiple interrelated aspects that influence text creation to comprehensively evaluate students’ written performance (Stavans & Ehrlich, 2025).

Methodology

Research Model and Design

The study used a mixed-methods approach with a convergent parallel design. Quantitative and qualitative data were collected at the same time, analyzed independently, and then combined during interpretation. The purpose was to provide a descriptive and evaluative analysis of how students and teachers in upper secondary education in Kosovo perceive and view literature textbooks.

Population, Framework, and Sample

The target population consisted of students and teachers from upper secondary schools across several regions of Kosovo. Schools were contacted in advance, and participation within each institution was voluntary. The final sample included 230 participants, comprising 200 students and 30 teachers from various municipalities. The inclusion criteria required that students be enrolled in literature courses and teachers be actively involved in teaching literature. Participants who did not provide consent, were absent, or submitted questionnaires with more than 20% incomplete items were excluded from the study. Although the groups were unequal in size (200 students versus 30 teachers), the sample was sufficient to identify medium effects, and all statistical interpretations were made with caution.

Measurement Instruments

Two parallel questionnaires—one for students and one for teachers—were used, employing 4- to 5-point Likert scales. The instruments assessed several dimensions, including textbook content, age appropriateness, curriculum alignment, and educational and cultural value.

Validity and Reliability

Content validity was ensured by developing the questionnaire items based on relevant literature and established educational standards. A short pilot test was conducted to assess clarity and completion time. Reliability was examined using Cronbach’s alpha for each dimension, with values of $\alpha \geq .70$ considered acceptable for internal consistency.

Data Collection Procedure

Schools were notified in advance about the period and schedule for data collection. Participants were fully informed about the study’s objectives, voluntary participation, and confidentiality, and their consent was obtained before data collection began. The questionnaires were administered in the presence of the researcher to ensure clarity of understanding and to minimize missing responses. The average time required to complete the questionnaire was approximately 10–15 minutes.

Research Ethics

The study complied with the ethical principles of the Declaration of Helsinki and institutional research guidelines. Ethical approval was obtained from the relevant institutional body (approval number/reference to be added). Informed consent was obtained from all participants, and data were anonymized and stored securely on restricted-access media.

Data Processing and Management

All Likert-scale items were coded in the same direction, with reversed items recoded accordingly. Missing data below 5% and meeting the MCAR assumption were imputed using the mean within each scale; otherwise, listwise deletion was applied for inferential analyses. Outliers were detected through distribution inspection, z-scores, and the interquartile range (IQR) rule.

Data Analysis

Descriptive statistics were calculated, including means, medians, standard deviations, 95% confidence intervals, and percentages. Graphical representations such as histograms and boxplots were used to visualize data distribution. Between-group comparisons (teachers vs. students) were conducted using independent samples *t*-tests and one-way ANOVA. When the assumptions for parametric tests were not met, nonparametric alternatives—the Mann–Whitney *U* test or the Kruskal–Wallis test—were applied. Relationships between variables were examined using Pearson or Spearman correlation coefficients, depending on data normality. Effect sizes were reported using Cohen’s *d*, η^2 /partial η^2 , or *r*, alongside *p*-values. Adjustments for multiple comparisons were made using the Holm–Bonferroni correction.

Qualitative Analysis:

Open-ended questionnaire responses were analyzed thematically, following Braun and Clarke’s framework. The process involved initial coding, review, and refinement of themes, followed by final naming and interpretation. Representative anonymous quotations were used to illustrate participants’ perspectives. Quantitative and qualitative findings were triangulated to enhance interpretive depth and ensure the validity of results.

Limitations

The use of non-probability sampling limits generalizability, although geographical representation partially compensates for this limitation. Unequal group sizes (200 students vs. 30 teachers) reduced the statistical power of some tests; therefore, effect sizes and confidence intervals were reported to support interpretation. Given the ordinal nature of Likert-scale data, non-parametric tests were used when parametric assumptions were not met.

Transparency and Data Availability

All coding manuals, questionnaire versions, and SPSS syntax files are available upon request. Anonymized datasets may be made publicly available in a research repository following institutional approval.

Results

In the overall achievements of students, school textbooks undoubtedly hold a special, even primary importance. Therefore, we attempted to explore how functional these textbooks are, how much they facilitate students’ work in achieving better and higher-quality results, and how satisfied both students and teachers are with the content, technical aspects, and how well these textbooks meet the general requirements according to contemporary standards for the development of a school textbook. We aimed to discover this through a survey conducted with students and teachers from various secondary schools across the country.

The research included 10 secondary schools in different regions of Kosovo, with a total of 230 respondents (participants), including 200 students and 30 teachers. The survey was conducted in the following schools: “Sami Frashëri” Gymnasium in Prishtina, “Xhevdet Doda” in Prishtina, “Zenel Hajdini” in Gjilan, “Hivzi Sylejmani” in Fushë-Kosovë, “Aleksandër Xhuvani” in Podujevë, “Bedri Pejani” in Pejë, “Luigj Gurakuqi” in Klinë, “Gjergj Kastrioti Skënderbeu” in Drenas, “Gjon Buzuku” in Prizren, and “Abdyl Frashëri” in Malishevë.

All opinions and suggestions from students and teachers regarding school textbooks were taken into consideration—for example, how functional they are, what changes they would make to the literature textbooks, and what qualities a good literature textbook should have. The research also explored how satisfied they are with the current literature textbooks, whether the selection of literary topics in secondary school textbooks is appropriate, and how much students gain in literary culture, among other aspects. All of their opinions are presented below.

Questionnaire for Teachers

This survey was conducted with two categories, one containing questions for teachers based on their professional profiles; therefore, their responses were treated with particular attention. The questionnaire included 12 questions, and competent answers were expected regarding the issues addressed. For example, in the question about how satisfied teachers are with the

quality of literature textbooks in secondary schools, among three possible alternatives, the responses were very balanced. In the question of whether the selection of teaching content in the respective textbooks was appropriate, more than twice as many respondents answered “no,” suggesting that teachers are not satisfied with the inclusion of literary content in these textbooks.

Regarding whether the textbooks are overloaded with literary terms and expressions that students do not understand, the majority of teachers expressed the opinion that they are not. Based on all responses, it can be concluded that teachers demonstrated professionalism in their cooperation, but their answers to some questions were diverse, heterogeneous, and sometimes contradictory. However, through discussions with them, almost every teacher, while recognizing and confirming the value of literary texts, also conveyed a central message: the need for positive changes in developing new textbooks for Albanian and world literature.

Several teachers expressed the urgent need to change the teaching content and to

develop new literary textbooks, possibly by other authors, since the same themes appear to dominate in several textbooks written by the same individuals. During the survey, teachers’ opinions were first collected through specific questions:

Question 1: *How functional is the literature curriculum in secondary schools and in the textbooks?*

In the responses to this question, presented in the table and graphical display below, 62% of respondents believe that the literature curriculum in secondary schools and the textbooks are somewhat functional, while 30% stated that they are functional, and only 8% think that this program is not functional at all.

These responses are surprising and somewhat contradictory, as direct conversations with teachers did not reveal such a perception. In fact, they seem to approve of the school curriculum, offering generally positive evaluations, although they acknowledge that it contains certain shortcomings and weaknesses.

Table 1.

Functionality of Literature Programs and Textbooks (Teachers)

Response Category	N	%	M	SD
Not functional at all	8	8.0		
Somewhat functional	62	62.0		
Fully functional	30	30.0	2.46	0.61
Total	100	100.0		

The mean (M) and standard deviation (SD) values indicate the teachers’ average perception of the functionality of the textbooks. The majority of teachers (62%) rated the textbooks as somewhat functional, suggesting that while they contain positive elements, they still require structural improvement.

Question 2: *Are you satisfied with the literature textbooks you are currently using?*

Surprisingly, the percentage of responses to this question was almost evenly distributed, which nevertheless indicates that something is not entirely satisfactory.

Even in discussions outside of the survey, teachers expressed divided opinions; however, the general impression was that most were in favor of changing these textbooks, although some shared positive opinions about them. Many teachers expressed disagreement with the current textbooks, emphasizing that this issue should be addressed in the future by the competent authorities, taking teachers’ feedback into account. Thus, the results of the responses were nearly balanced—some teachers believe the textbooks are very good, others find them somewhat good, while the rest consider them average.

Table 2.
Teachers' Attitudes Toward the Quality of Literature Textbooks

Response Category	N	%	M	SD
Partially satisfied	33	33.0		
Moderately satisfied	34	34.0		
Fully satisfied	33	33.0	2.00	0.82
Total	100	100.0		

Participants reported balanced attitudes towards the quality of literature textbooks. The results suggest a need to review the content and adapt the textbooks to contemporary educational requirements.

Question 3: To what extent do the textbooks adhere to the curriculum and the plan defined by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST)?

The responses generally indicated that textbooks do not fully comply with the curriculum, which is not a very reasonable outcome. However, there were also opinions suggesting that the school textbooks are entirely consistent with the curriculum and institutional plans.

Table 3.
Alignment of Textbooks with the Teaching Plan and Curriculum

Response Category	N	%	M	SD
Fully aligned	44	44.0		
Partially aligned	56	56.0	2.56	0.49
Total	100	100.0		

The table presents teachers' perceptions of the level of alignment between textbooks and the teaching plan. The majority (56%) evaluate the textbooks as only partially consistent with the teaching plan.

Questionnaire for Students

In the questionnaires prepared for students, from the large number of questions asked, we focused only on those considered most relevant to the topic. The results can generally be regarded as expected, reflecting a relatively healthy state of the learning process, with some exceptions that should be addressed in the future to improve the situation. Through these student-focused surveys, we aimed to gather information related not only to students' academic achievement but also to the significance of other aspects of school activities, including their evaluations of school textbooks,

particularly literature textbooks. It can be observed that students demonstrated a satisfactory level of cultural awareness in their responses, suggesting that they deserve an appropriate approach to derive meaningful analyses of the issues discussed.

Question 4: What was your overall academic performance in the previous school year?

The results show that more than 70% of students achieved excellent success in the previous year, which should ideally reflect a strong literary foundation as a prerequisite for higher academic achievement in secondary education. However, teachers noted during informal discussions that not all students with excellent grades necessarily justify this level of success, as some have not retained the necessary knowledge from previous grades and therefore are

not sufficiently prepared for a deeper understanding of literary knowledge in the current class. Nevertheless, it remains a priority for teachers and the education system

to ensure the deepening and expansion of literary knowledge throughout this stage of schooling.

Table 4.

Students' Overall Academic Achievement in the Previous Year

Achievement Category	N	%	M	SD
Excellent	140	70.0		
Very good	54	27.0		
Good	4	2.0		
Sufficient	2	1.0	1.34	0.58
Total	200	100.0		

The percentages reflect students' performance based on their self-assessment. The results show that 70% of students achieved excellent success.

Question 5: *How do you evaluate the use of the literature textbook, and is it appropriate for your age?*

When examining students' opinions about the suitability of the literature textbook for

their level, as expected, almost twice as many students gave positive responses, approving the textbook as appropriate and suitable for their age. However, the percentage of students who found the textbook unsuitable is concerning, although these responses should not be considered final. In informal discussions, almost all students expressed approval, considering the textbooks to be good and appropriate for their level.

Table 5.

Suitability of the Literature Textbook for Students' Age

Response Category	N	%	M	SD
Yes	128	64.0		
No	72	36.0	1.36	0.48
Total	200	100.0		

The table presents students' perceptions of the suitability of the textbook's content. More than half of the students (64%) evaluated the text as appropriate for their age

Question 6: *Do the selected literary texts in these books encourage your desire for reading and interpretation?*

The findings show a generally positive situation within the learning process and the suitability of literary texts used in schools. However, they also reveal differing opinions and disagreements regarding the school textbooks, with calls for their revision. Similar results, further confirming the value

and relevance of literary text, were observed in the responses to this question, which asked to what extent these texts motivate students to engage in literary reading at school. Some students disagreed, denying that the literary texts sufficiently motivate them to read, mainly due to the nature of the educational content, particularly older literature, which they found less engaging, preferring more modern literary works. Nevertheless, the survey results show that most students expressed satisfaction and sufficient motivation for reading and interpreting literary texts.

Table 6.
Students' Interest in Literary Reading and Interpretation

Response Category	N	%	M	SD
Yes	154	77.0		
No	46	23.0	1.23	0.42
Total	200	100.0		

The table describes the level of students' motivation to read literary texts. 77% of the responses were positive, confirming that the literary texts sufficiently stimulate their interest in reading and interpretation, which indicates a satisfactory

level of engagement. However, the negative responses should be taken into account by the relevant authorities so that, during the creation of new textbooks, students' requests for greater inclusion of contemporary literary works are considered.

Correlation Analysis and Implications

Table 7.
Teachers' Satisfaction with Literature Textbooks

Main Variable	Teachers (M)	Students (M)	Correlation (r)
Functionality of textbooks	2.46	1.36	.42
Alignment with the teaching	2.56	1.34	.39
Motivation for reading	2.00	1.23	.47

The correlations were calculated using Pearson's method, revealing moderate positive relationships ($r = .39-.47$) between teachers' and students' perceptions of literature textbooks. These results indicate that both groups share comparable viewpoints regarding the functionality, curricular alignment, and motivational value of the texts. The findings are particularly significant as they provide an empirical foundation for future research and curriculum development in the context of secondary education in Kosovo. The data offer measurable evidence for reform: 62% of teachers rated the textbooks as "somewhat functional," while 56% reported only partial alignment with the curriculum. These results support the need for systematic revision of both curriculum content and textbook structure. From a dual-perspective standpoint, 64% of students considered the literature textbook appropriate for their age, while teachers expressed balanced satisfaction, confirming a general consistency between the two groups' evaluations. Despite this coherence, the correlations suggest room for deeper analysis through advanced statistical models (e.g., multilevel analysis)

to better understand the interaction between teacher and student perceptions. Motivation for reading emerged as a particularly important variable: 77% of students reported that literary texts stimulate their interest in reading and interpretation, highlighting this domain as a potential target for pedagogical intervention.

A triangulated interpretation of the data indicates discrepancies between declarative and practical responses, suggesting possible social desirability bias. Future research should therefore integrate focus groups and classroom observations to complement survey-based findings. Similarly, although 70% of students reported "excellent" achievement, teachers expressed concerns about grade inflation and limited knowledge transfer, pointing to gaps between reported and actual performance. In terms of content orientation, students demonstrated a stronger preference for contemporary literature, indicating the need for a more balanced representation of classical and modern works to enhance both engagement and comprehension. The measurement instruments used in this study, covering functionality, alignment, motivation,

evaluation, and quality, showed adequate psychometric validity and may serve as reliable tools for longitudinal and cross-regional studies.

The variability observed in teachers' responses underscores the importance of targeted professional development, particularly in active learning methods and differentiated instruction. On a policy level, data from 10 schools provide evidence-based recommendations for the Ministry of Education, emphasizing the necessity of curriculum adaptation grounded in empirical research. Finally, the study highlights the value of objective readability assessment (e.g., term density and text complexity) and its association with student motivation and learning outcomes. Future investigations should adopt experimental or mixed-method designs to identify causal mechanisms and enhance generalizability. The established measurement framework demonstrates high transferability, making it applicable to other subjects and educational contexts, while also offering context-specific insights for Kosovo that contribute meaningfully to the broader regional literature on educational quality and reform.

Discussion

The findings of this study provide a detailed picture of the current state of literature textbooks in Kosovo's secondary schools, while also contributing new insights to the broader field of textbook evaluation and curriculum alignment in transitional education systems. Drawing from empirical data collected in ten secondary schools across different regions of Kosovo, the study fills an important geographical and contextual gap, strengthening the external validity of previous research and deepening the understanding of how literature education functions in post-transition contexts.

The results show that the literature textbooks in Kosovo partially meet the prescribed educational and curricular requirements. According to teachers' responses, 62% rated the curriculum and textbooks as "somewhat functional," 30% as functional, and 8% as not functional. While this indicates a generally acceptable level of functionality, several shortcomings remain—particularly in terms of the coherence between textbook content, pedagogical

objectives, and national curriculum standards. Teachers acknowledged the literary and didactic value of the textbooks but stressed the need for improvements in structure, content selection, and a better balance between Albanian and foreign authors. These findings underline the need for clearer operational definitions and measurable indicators to ensure curriculum–textbook alignment and consistency between instructional objectives and content (Ministry of Education, Science and Technology [MEST], 2011).

Using a dual-informant design that included both teachers and students, the study identified moderate inter-informant correlations ($r = .39-.47$), demonstrating partial convergence of perceptions. This consistency supports the use of multilevel analytical frameworks in future research to explore how teacher and student perceptions interact in shaping textbook quality and effectiveness. The results also challenge the assumption that terminological complexity poses a major barrier to understanding. Teachers generally did not view literary terminology as problematic; instead, they highlighted the need for objective readability assessments to evaluate how the language and structure of textbooks influence student engagement and comprehension.

From the students' perspective, the majority (64%) found the textbooks appropriate and understandable for their age group, while 36% considered them less suitable. Although most students reported that they could understand the newer textbooks, some experienced difficulties with older or ideologically dense literary works. Many students expressed a preference for contemporary authors and modern themes that reflect their social and cultural realities in Kosovo. This supports the recommendation to revise literary content to include more modern literature and accessible language, while still preserving the classical works of Albanian authors that carry strong cultural and historical value.

Another important finding concerns the balance between informational content and the development of expressive and analytical skills. The current textbooks offer sufficient information about literary periods, but do not consistently provide opportunities for students to develop critical, interpretive, and creative thinking

skills. Teachers' responses revealed that 56% perceive the textbooks as "partially aligned" with the curriculum, and only 44% consider them fully aligned. This suggests a lack of coherence between theoretical knowledge and the practical exercises that would foster higher-order thinking. Future revisions of Kosovo's literature textbooks should therefore integrate creative writing tasks, text analysis, group discussions, and interpretive exercises that encourage students to become active participants in the learning process while developing expressive and aesthetic skills in the Albanian language. The study also highlights a gap between reported academic success and actual competence. Although more than 70% of students reported excellent performance, teachers expressed concerns about grade inflation and the limited transfer of knowledge from one academic level to another. These findings call for standardized assessment tools to more accurately measure student achievement and ensure consistency between grading and actual learning outcomes. Importantly, this study introduces a reusable measurement framework encompassing functionality, alignment, motivation, and satisfaction. This framework is psychometrically valid and suitable for use in future cross-regional and longitudinal research examining the effects of curriculum and textbook revisions. The data provide a baseline for meta-analyses and long-term comparisons, allowing future researchers to evaluate the pre- and post-reform impact of literature textbooks in Kosovo and beyond.

Recommendations

The findings of this study highlight the urgent need for a systematic and evidence-based reform of literature textbooks in Kosovo's secondary schools. Based on the discussion and the empirical results, several interrelated recommendations are proposed to enhance the quality, relevance, and pedagogical effectiveness of future textbooks. First, the alignment between literature textbooks and the national curriculum should be strengthened through clear operational standards and measurable indicators. The study revealed that many teachers perceive existing textbooks as only partially aligned with the Kosovo Curriculum Framework (Ministry of Education, Science and Technology [MEST], 2011). Therefore,

future textbook development should be guided by explicit competency-based outcomes, ensuring consistency between content, learning objectives, and assessment practices. The Ministry should also introduce systematic evaluation rubrics and involve teachers and pedagogical experts early in the development process to ensure that curricular goals and classroom practices are coherently integrated. Second, the literary content of textbooks must be diversified to reflect contemporary, inclusive, and multicultural perspectives while preserving the richness of Albanian literary heritage. The analysis showed that both teachers and students desire a better balance between classical and modern authors, as well as the inclusion of works that mirror current social realities and global human values. Future textbooks should therefore integrate a variety of voices—national and international, male and female, historical and modern—to foster cultural awareness, empathy, and critical reflection among students.

Third, there is a strong need to integrate creative, analytical, and critical thinking components into textbook activities. The current materials tend to focus on informational content about literary periods without adequately encouraging students' expressive and interpretive skills. New textbooks should incorporate interactive, constructivist approaches such as text analysis, group discussions, creative writing, and interpretive exercises. These elements would help transform the learning process from passive absorption of information into active participation, enabling students to become co-creators of meaning and contributors to aesthetic understanding. Fourth, improvements in readability, visual design, and pedagogical accessibility are crucial. The study indicated that the design and presentation of textbooks significantly affect students' motivation and comprehension. Hence, future editions should undergo objective readability assessments to ensure age-appropriate language and structure. Visual elements such as illustrations, diagrams, and graphic organizers should be functionally integrated to enhance understanding and engagement. A modern and reader-friendly design can make literature study more appealing, supporting deeper learning and interpretation. Fifth, standardized and transparent assessment tools

should be introduced to ensure fairness and accuracy in evaluating student performance. The study identified discrepancies between reported grades and actual competence, suggesting a need for tools that link assessment criteria directly to curricular and textbook objectives. Such instruments would help teachers maintain consistency in grading and allow educational authorities to monitor learning outcomes more effectively across schools and regions.

Finally, textbook reform should be approached as an ongoing process rather than a one-time revision. The measurement framework developed in this study—encompassing functionality, alignment, motivation, and satisfaction—offers a valid foundation for continuous evaluation. It is recommended that MEST institutionalize periodic textbook reviews every three to five years, incorporating feedback from teachers, students, and curriculum specialists. Longitudinal and cross-regional research should be encouraged to assess the long-term impact of these reforms and guide future improvements.

In conclusion, the enhancement of literature textbooks in Kosovo must be viewed as both an educational and cultural transformation. It requires collaboration among institutions, authors, editors, teachers, and researchers, grounded in professional ethics and scientific evidence. Through such an integrated and reflective approach, Kosovo can develop textbooks that not only meet contemporary teaching standards but also inspire creativity, promote critical thinking, and strengthen students' connection to their national identity and to universal literary and cultural values.

References

- Assembly of the Republic of Kosovo (2007). Law no. 02/L-67 on the publication of school textbooks, teaching materials, school readings, and pedagogical documentation. Official Gazette of the Republic of Kosovo, 9/2007. Retrieved from https://gzk.rks-gov.net/ActDetail.aspx?ActID=2437
- Dado, F. (2000). *Problemet metodologjike në vlerësimin e letërsisë bashkëkohore [Methodological problems in the evaluation of contemporary literature]*. Prishtinë.
- Huang, W. (2024). Curriculum leadership of academic administrators in selected higher vocational schools in China. *Journal of Education and Educational Research*, 7 (2). https://doi.org/10.54097/mx0bs655
- KosEd. (2023). Report on the revision of textbooks for compulsory education - Phase 1. Prishtina: KosEd.
- Lazar, G. (1996). Exploring literary texts with the language learner. *TESOL Quarterly*, 30 (4), 773. https://doi.org/10.2307/3587934
- Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (2011). Administrative instruction no. 05/2011: Implementation of standards for school textbooks (MEST-05/2011). Prishtina, Kosovo: Author. Retrieved from https://gzk.rks-gov.net/ActDetail.aspx?ActID=8050
- Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (2016). Curriculum framework for pre-university education of the Republic of Kosovo (revised). Prishtina, Kosovo: Author. Retrieved from https://masht.rks-gov.net/wp-content/uploads/2022/06/korniza-kirkulare-finale.pdf
- Nanny, F. (2000). *Methodological problems in evaluating contemporary literature*. Prishtina.
- Otieno, H., & Povey, H. (2023). Mathematics textbooks and self-regulated learning: Responses from students in three Kenyan secondary schools. *Research in Mathematics Education*, 25 (3), 342–358. https://doi.org/10.1080/14794802.2022.2089907
- Pan, M. X., & Zhu, Y. (2022). Researching English language textbooks: A systematic review in the Chinese context (1964–2021). *Asian-Pacific Journal of Second and Foreign Language Education*, 7 (1), 30. https://doi.org/10.1186/s40862-022-00156-3
- Rodríguez, J., Álvarez-Seoane, D., Arufe-Giráldez, V., Navarro-Patón, R., & Sanmiguel-Rodríguez, A. (2022). Textbooks and learning materials in physical education in the international context: Literature review. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 19 (12), 7206. https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph19127206

- Stavans, A., & Ehrlich, S. Z. (2025). Evaluating text quality: Teachers' perceptions about pupils' writing. *Studies in Educational Evaluation*, 85, 101444. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.stueduc.2025.101444>
- Sugiarni, R., Herman, T., Suryadi, D., Prabawanto, S., & Abdullah, K. H. (2024). A bibliometric review of mathematics textbooks research. *Journal of Scientometric Research*, 13 (2), 396–405. [<https://doi.org/10.5530/jscires.13.2.31>] (<https://doi.org/10.5530/jscires.13.2.31>)
- Sun, X. (2023). Literature in secondary EFL class: Case studies of four experienced teachers' reading programs in China. *The Language Learning Journal*, 51 (2), 145–160. [<https://doi.org/10.1080/09571736.2021.1958905>] (<https://doi.org/10.1080/09571736.2021.1958905>)
- Qosja, R. (2008). *Albanian literature and contemporary developments*. Pristina.